Right to Information & Budget Transparency in Mexico: A Decade of Achievements & Challenges

Juan Pablo Guerrero – Former Information Commissioner & Secretary General
Federal Institute for Access to Information & Data Protection

Content

I. Right to Information (RTI) & transparency: global trends
II. Overview of the RTI in Mexico
III. RTI: Best Practice Law Principles
IV. Institutional Settings In Mexico
V. Ten years of using the RTI
VI. Impacts of Transparency
VII. A new phase in 2014: Constitutional amendments
I. Overview of RTI in the world – 101 Regulations

Orange: Countries with RTI law in force
Green: Countries with legal decrees and regulations on access to information
Yellow: Countries with RTI law passed - not in force

Informe de Autoevaluación primer semestre 2009
Instituto Federal de Acceso a la Información y Protección de Datos

David Banisar, March 2013; IFAI, January 2014
RTI+Transparency: powerful global trends

• Since the 90’s, Transparency & RTI are linked to governance concerns
• Resource misallocations, budget captured, unsustainable entitlements, dangerous levels of debt & financial risk, corruption: tax payers should follow the money

Global Spread of RTI & Transparency

• Institutional capacity in question: accountability, checks & balances, increase performance needed
• Civil Society: key stakeholder for trust, rule of law, participative development
• Growing importance of ICT, internet, mobile phones, social networks, open data, communications revolution
II. Overview of the RTI in Mexico

- 1977: Constitutional amendment that sets forth the obligation of the State to guarantee the RTI
- 2002: Federal Transparency and Access to Government Public Information Act (FOIA Equivalent)
- 2007: Constitutional amendment that enshrines access to information as a fundamental right
- 2010: Federal Institute for Access to Information & Data Protection: IFAI also in charge of data protection
- 2014: Constitutional amendment that broadens the scope of RTI in Mexico

II. RTI in Mexico: A Propitious Context

- 70 year long one-party rule system came to an end in 2000
- Open Government: a campaign commitment of the challenger/winner (Pt. Vicente Fox 2000-06)
- Engagement of civil society in legislative process: 3 initiatives (Left, Executive, Oaxaca Group) and significant public debate
- Key High Government Officials were unaware of RTI implications (Finance; Justice Dept)
III. The Basic Law Principles in a Good Practice Model

- Maximum disclosure
- Exemptions clearly established & frequently require harm test
- RTI applies to all branches of Federal Government (no exclusions)
- Private life and personal data are protected
- RTI is free of charge
- Expeditious procedures: time framework for response & complaints is clearly established
- Independent Oversight Body (IOB) with binding powers
- Complaints can challenge administrative silence and other ways of not providing information
- IOB: Legal mandate to promote the exercise of the RTI
- Proactive disclosure of relevant government information

IV. Institutional Settings

The Federal Institute for Access to Information & Data Protection (IFAI)

- Independent Oversight Body: Quasi-jurisdictional administrative court (binding decisions)
- Resolves complaints & determines whether the information should be disclosed/public
- Requesters can always appeal to the Judiciary
- Investigative powers and calls for public hearings when necessary
- Obligation to help the applicant (remedy deficient complaints)
- Can verify classified information at any time
- Can initiate a process of administrative responsibility against public officials
IV. Institutional Settings

**Broad use of Information Technologies**

**INFOMEX:** Users can submit information requests & complaint to IFAI through electronic means, without having to present ID or justify their requests.

**Google-like search engine of public information requests and resolutions by the IFAI; users can enter key words and phrases in the system, which provides results of related cases.**

**An on-line system through which citizens have access to proactively disclosed government information.**

V. Ten years of using the RTI

**Main results: trust and efficiency**

• Anyone, anytime, anywhere, can request information via the internet.

• Anonymity: officials focus on whether the information is public or not; concerns about who is requesting and why are eliminated.

• Reduced risk of harassment or retaliation, results in less than 4 months.
Informe de Autoevaluación
primer semestre 2009
Instituto Federal de Acceso a la Información y Protección de Datos

Number of information requests submitted to the Federal Government
From June 12, 2003 to March 20, 2014

Total number of information requests
1,045,719

Appeals for review filed before IFAI vs Federal Agencies*
From June 12, 2013 to March 20, 2014

Total number of complaints before IFAI
54,562

* Ratio to requests for information submitted

SOURCE: IFAI/SGCV
VI. Impacts of Transparency

Unthinkable information disclosures before 2002:

- Meetings minutes, meetings agendas and e-mails from the Office of the President are disclosed
- Guests list + expenditures of President's birthday
- Copies of invoices for presidential purchases in ladies' boutiques ($$$ in Cartier, Louis Vuitton, Dior)
- Energy reform campaign 2014: explain how gas & electricity costs will go down
VI. Impacts of Transparency

- RTI is a fundamental right that allows a positive impact on people’s lives:
  - Gives access to information related to clinic records or pensions
  - Allows access to basic public services: education and health budgets and farming subsidies, among others
  - Observes the law enforcement: regulatory framework, permits, licences, concessions, etc.
  - Allows monitoring of the budget expenditure

VII. Constitutional Amendment (2004); Main Features

1. Binds all public authorities on every corner of the country to the same ATI regime: 3 branches of government, 3 levels of government, political parties, autonomous bodies, public trusts, and any individual, legal entity or union that receives and spends public funds or performs acts of public authority

2. IFAI becomes a constitutionally autonomous body with final resolutions for public agencies, legally binding and unchallengeable
VII. Targeted efforts on Open Budget (OB)

1. Comprehensiveness: information must be complete, updated and historical
2. Meaningful information: timely, simple, accessible & in usable format
3. Dialogue: CSOs, academia & specialists on budget issues must provide inputs & feedback
4. Consultation: supply of information must respond to demand needs: what information do citizens need?
5. Comply with & impact in international OB assessment tools:
   • IMF Fiscal Transparency Code / OECD Best Practices for Budget Transparency
   • World Bank PEFA / World Customs Organization (WCO) Arusha Declaration
   • Open Budget Initiative; The Open Budget Index / Extractive Industries Transparency Initiative (EITI)

Open Budget Information Good Practices

**United States**

www.recovery.gov
Allocation of “Recovery Act” resources data, including contracts, loans, collaterals and fiscal beneficiaries.

**Brazil**

Portal Federativo
Best practices about proactively disclosed information, access to wide range of useful information, “success stories” portal, georeferenced & thematic data available.

**Australia**

Economic Stimulus Plan
Portal with public investment data by sector (housing, communications, hydraulic works, train rails, etc.), in a geo-referenced platform.
Ministry of Finance (MX): Fiscal Transparency Portal (FTP)

www.transparenciapresupuestaria.gob.mx

- Statistics: visits increased 28.5% from 2012 – 2013, 46% in 1st quarter 2013-2014

- Objective
  - Increase transparency in PFM
    - Government Finance Statistics
    - Transferred resources to local governments
    - Budget Analytical Information
    - Quarterly reports in open data formats
    - Year-end report

- Citizen language for Fiscal Transparency
  - Citizens budget
  - Citizen year-end report
  - FAQ
  - Glossary
  - Social media

- Fiscal Transparency on issues responding to citizens interests
  - Investment projects
  - Performance information (indicators and goals)
  - External evaluations
  - Reconstruction aid for natural disasters
• Special feature: the FT-Portal displays information about the budget performance evaluation system, including external evaluations for social programs & public policies (1000+) & program indicators (757).

• Investment & Public works allocations: FT-Portal provides information about investments & natural disasters special fund allocations

• Download in open data formats is possible

• These tools trigged positive changes in MoF internal processes to enhance budget efficiency
• The citizen factor. Various citizens budget versions to explain the budget enactment (since ‘10), the budget proposal (since ‘12) & the year-end report (‘13).

• These documents & the FT-Portal have been the result of consultation and a dialogue with specialized SCO, allowing for significant content improvement since 2010 (first edition). Relevant inputs also come from inquiries/suggestions through the FT-Portal.

• One of the main distribution channel for citizens budget is the Tax Administration Service, as attachment of the tax declaration receipt confirmation. Since 2014, budget transparency posters are posted in the Tax Administration Service and the Information Liaison Unit in every Federal agency.

Citizens Budget Content

• Growth estimates
• Total expenditures
• Income sources including debt - deficit
• Functional classification
• Administrative classification
• Economic classification
• Main investment projects
• Expenditure reduction measures
• Performance evaluation system information (ie percentage of expenditure w/ performance indicators)
• Social media and contact information
• Links to additional information & related topics

All expenditure data is presented for the current & previous fiscal year.
Dialogue with CSOs

- Open data formats have allowed CSOs the reuse and promotion of relevant issues
  - Budget performance information on programs has been linked via social media to legislative discussions on future allocations, as a means for accountability of representatives during the budget approval.
  - SCOs have made recommendations on public policies (like sustainable urban development), affecting policy operating rules of related programs.

Based on the introduction of these fiscal transparency initiatives, Mexico was among the countries that provide “significant budget information” according to the Open Budget Index 2012.

Thank you!
Federal Institute for Access to Information & Data Protection

guerrero@fiscaltransparency.org

internacional@ifai.org.mx