In December 2015 the government of Globistan took a decision to centralize the recruitment efforts of its various ministries.

In March 2016 a separate agency, Human Capital, was created. This agency reports directly to the office of the Minister of Social Affairs.

Human Capital collects on an ongoing basis the recruitment needs from the various ministries. Based on the criteria defined by the ministries, Human Capital identifies the proper recruitment process. some recruitments are internal only, while others aim to attract external candidates.

All recruitment processes start with a vacancy notice. The external vacancy notice is published in the official ‘gazette’ of Globistan and on the website of Human Capital. Candidates are invited to apply within a specific deadline. Together with their application, candidates are required to submit a set of documents. Both the application and the submission of documents can be done by mail or on-line through the website.

After a review of the documents submitted, a shortlist of candidates is prepared. Candidates on the shortlist will have to go through some tests. Human Capital developed itself a number of tests. For more complex positions, Human Capital outsources the testing to a specialized provider. The candidates who successfully passed the tests are invited for an interview. For some lower level positions, no testing may be required.

After having received feedback from the interviews, Human Capital develops a list with a proposed ranking of the successful candidates. This list is submitted to a Selection Committee, that will determine the chosen candidate. the Selection Committee is composed of some staff members of various ministries. The committee may also identify other candidates on the list to be put on a reserve list for future vacancies. Candidates on the reserve list will not have to go through the selection process anymore.

Candidates whose applications are not withheld at any stage of the process are notified by regular mail or email.

Human Capital has to comply with the new legislation on privacy.

**Proposals from Tashkent:**

**Business objectives:**

2 recipients, so 2 business objectives from the business owner’s prospective

Ministry’ s business objective: To get the **professional** people **on time**

Agency’ s business objective: To hire the most appropriate professionals in the effective way

**Audit objective:**

To get the assurance if the HR agency does it’s best to hire the professionals for the Ministry.

If the HR Agency do the selection on time, according to the legal procedure, transparent and efficient?

if the Agency recruit (are the controls in place) to ensure the professionals on time?

To assess the efficiency, quality, transparency of the HR recruitment process

**The major risks in the process**

1. Not qualified people to organize the selection process
2. Are the selection criteria appropriate? Different criteria for internal and external selection
3. Is the selection process effective: the timing. TO LATE
4. The objective of the agency could not fit with the objective of the Ministry: how to reach the objective in the …

How it is the information controlled? Information security: partly electronically, partly on paper,

1. Selection is not standardized, the questions are not appropriate
2. There is not enough communication with the client, the Ministry representative

Is the HR agency equipped appropriate to recruit appropriate professionals?

To ensure the best way to recruit the appropriate professional that fit the best the Ministry’s needs?

Are the people for HR agency qualified enough to select the most appropriate professionals?

Is the process transparent? Is the selection done in the proper way?

Scope: 2 dimensions, external and internal recruitment

**Proposals from Brussels: WORK PROGRAMME FOR AUDIT FIELDWORK**

| **Nr** | **Process** | **Inherent Risk (before controls)** | **Risk rating** | **Mitigating Controls/Attributes****(Expected)** | **Tests of design** | **Control Adequacy** | **Tests of implementation** | **X-Ref****Control effectiveness** | **Conclusion** |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |
| 1 | Identification of staffing needs | Staffing needs are incorrectly identified from a quantitative point of view (i.e., too many or not enough resources are identified in a particular unit, department etc).Staffing needs are not timely identified.Criteria/ priorities used for identification/ allocation of staffing needs are not in accordance with unit's or department's necessities, strategies, objectives etc.Inappropriate level of competencies is identified for the staffing needs.Inappropriate staff category needs are identified (i.e., officials vs other particular categories of personnel - temporary staff etc). | HighHighHighHighHigh | *- existence of an HR strategy;**- existence of a written recruitment procedure;**- existence of a list of criteria/ priorities used for identification of staffing needs in terms of:** *quantity: benchmarks are computed twice a year for language and other departments;*
* *quality: competency registers exist in each translation unit; job descriptions exist for all personnel and they include skills required for the respective job;*
* *timeliness: known staff departures are anticipated in documents sent for staff requests;*
* *category: the appropriate category of personnel is identified (i.e., officials, temporary staff, contract agents etc);*

*- existence of approvals for identified staffing needs;**- staff requests are analyzed;* | Verification of existence of:* an HR strategy;
* a written recruitment procedure;
* approval for identified staffing needs (i.e., the benchmarks);
* documentation of the benchmark calculation method.

Review of the existing HR strategy and assessment whether it is in line with the organization’s strategy.Review of the existing written recruitment procedure and assessment whether it is in line with the organization’s procedures and whether it contains all necessary elements to guide its users through an effective recruitment process.Review of the criteria/ priorities used to identify staffing needs (i.e., benchmarking) and assessment for reasonableness compared to the HR strategy and taking into account the unit’s specific needs; |  | - for a sample of selected recruitments review the criteria/ priorities used to identify staffing needs in terms of quantity, quality, timeliness and category; ensure that this was in line with the existing guidelines (i.e., trace the recruitment to the request made by the hiring unit and check the comparison with the benchmark);- for a sample of selected recruitments check that the appropriate approval was in place (i.e., the proposal to the Senior Management);- for a sample of selected periods verify the benchmark computation to ensure that it complies with the announced methodology;- perform a review of HR statistics for a selected period of time (i.e., staff turnover, mobility and an overview of the delays between the different stages of the recruitment process); discuss with management any unusual identified trends and inquire on the monitoring tools used for having an overview of the situation at each step of the recruitment process. |  |  |

**Additional proposals from Brussels:**

**Proposals from Brussels: Risks and controls**

**Risk**

Applications received by mail. High risk.

**Expected Control**

Procedure for receiving, storing mail and emails. Organizational structure for receiving the mails. Delegation of authority within organization. Awareness of the procedure. Coding of the applications. Complete document flow process in place.

**Testing**

If procedure for receiving, storing and tracking of mails is in place. Organizational structure is in compliance with procedures. Identify physical protection of e/mails. Completeness of documentation. If the procedures correspond to the system. Documentation include clearly assigned responsibilities and authorizations. If authorizations established are complied with in practice. If the mail could be tracked. Physical protection is in place (file cabinet). Complaint mechanism and staff in place to follow up on the complaints. No any document is lost, as a result of the application of the document flow process in place.

**Identification and assessment of control**

**Testing of control**

**------**

**Risk**

Interviews are not objective. **High risk.**

**Expected Control**

Procedure on establishment of the selection committee and documenting the evaluation process. The procedure to define the criteria for appointing the members of the selection committee. This committee to have 5 members at least, and max one from the requesting ministry and other members to be independent from the requesting ministry and applicant. Clear requirements for job and linked criteria for evaluation to be established before selection process started. Individuals declaration of the conflict of interest of the committee members. Have a separate process of written exam to be conducted anonymously, with the name and photo of the applicant to be removed from the CVs. Document the process and results of the selection and decision making. The committee members names should be kept confidential. Video recording of the selection to be digitalized.

Application via email to be processed by the automated system, to remind on the application deadline and inform on the decline. First to identify the deadline and establish procedure for the reminder and decline.

More than one person prepare the tests and questions. Two pair of eyes (at least) principle to be followed.

**Testing**

Test if all those procedures applied, including review of the procedure itself. On a sample bases review the video recording. If the required documentation was properly signed off and authorized.

Select 30 job offers for all the ministry, and out of all reperform the selection on 10 applications. Examine the accuracy of the CoI declaration.

**Identification and assessment of control**

**Testing of control**