**CONCEPT NOTE AND AGENDA**

**PEMPAL 2018 BCOP Plenary Meeting**

**Improving Effectiveness and Accountability of Public Expenditures:**

**Trends in Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations, Performance Budgeting and Budget Participation**

**March 14-16, 2018**

**Vienna, Austria**

**Background**

**Public Expenditure Management Peer Assisted Learning (PEMPAL) aims for the Governments of PEMPAL member countries from Europe and Central Asia (ECA) to more efficiently and effectively use public resources** resulting from applying good and improved PFM practices developed, promoted or shared with PEMPAL contribution. It does this by providing a well-functioning professional peer learning platform through which public finance practitioners from the member countries are networked to strengthen their capacities and to enable them to create and share knowledge and benchmarking.[[1]](#footnote-2) The Budget Community of Practice of PEMPAL focuses on enhancing budget policy and methodology. PEMPAL ([www.pempal.org](http://www.pempal.org)), was launched in 2006 with the help of the World Bank and a number of donors, and is currently supported by the World Bank, the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation, and the Swiss State Secretariat for Economic Affairs (SECO).

**The Budget Community of Practice (BCOP) of PEMPAL, led by the BCOP Executive Committee,[[2]](#footnote-3) organizes plenary meetings of its members on an annual basis** to discuss common public finance reform issues. In addition to these annual meetings, it also operates two working groups comprising a sub-set of its 21 member countries, on ‘budget literacy and transparency’ and ‘program and performance budgeting’ which meet more regularly via videoconference and periodically face-to-face. Study visits to specific countries are also held to examine reforms in more depth. In 2013-2017 BCOP held over 40 knowledge sharing and learning events. For more information refer to <https://www.pempal.org/event/budget>

**The topic of BCOP’s 2018 plenary meeting is *Improving Effectiveness and Accountability of Public Expenditures: Trends in Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations, Performance Budgeting and Budget Participation*.** BCOP Executive Committee selected the focus areas of the plenary meeting based on the analysis of the BCOP countries’ PFM priorities collected from 18 BCOP countries in April 2017 as inputs into the BCOP 2017/2018 Action Plan. The Executive Committee concluded that two areas of BCOP Working Groups focus - program and performance budgeting and budget transparency, literacy and participation - remain priority issues for BCOP and should be discussed under the annual plenary meeting. In addition, members revealed high interest to review trends in intergovernmental fiscal relations.

**Governments throughout the world increasingly focus on improving effectiveness of public expenditures to increase value for public money and improve the sustainability of public finances.** All three topics for the plenary meeting are motivated by effectiveness considerations. As growing citizens’ expectations and limited budgetary capacities create pressures on resources, increased accountability for public spending is necessary. Use of performance information in budget decisions and increased public participation in the budget process contribute to improving budget accountability and effectiveness. At the same time, considerations of subnational government level’s ability to design and/or implement policies best suited for their constituent communities is at heart of fiscal decentralization regardless of its extent and legal shape (i.e. in federal or unitary arrangements).

**While mostly having low and vulnerable own fiscal sources, subnational governments in most ECA countries shape key national policy sectors such as health, education, parts of social protection, as well as maintain local infrastructure, which results in their heavy dependency from the shared state taxes and inter-budgetary transfers**. In its essence, delegating fiscal decision-making powers to a level of government that is closer to the taxpayers and service beneficiaries facilitates both tailoring of policies to more local preferences and a tighter accountability[[3]](#footnote-4). Therefore, achieving citizens satisfaction with services delivered by subnational governments requires general efficiency of intergovernmental fiscal relations, equitability, and sustainability of inter-budgetary transfers**.** The governance of such transfers is complex, and practices vary widely across countries. International organizations note that the recent global crisis in many countries revealed weaknesses in intergovernmental fiscal coordination[[4]](#footnote-5). Some of the critical policy questions related to intergovernmental fiscal relations are: i) the role of centralized fiscal policies, the extent to which fiscal policies are harmonized across levels, and the size and function of transfers from the central to subnational levels, ii) the institutional arrangements between budget authorities at central and subnational level and the extent to which subnational operations and procedures are constrained.[[5]](#footnote-6). Ongoing implementation of performance budgeting in PEMPAL countries reveals additional topics for discussion, such as: what are the performance principles of transfer design? How does transfer design reflect mid-term and long-term sustainability? How can problems arising during budget execution phase be monitored and solved?

**The majority of PEMPAL countries continue adopting performance and program budgeting and have high interest to use of performance indicators in budget process.** Use of performance information enable the governments to improve the effectiveness of decision-making in budget allocations by facilitating the choice of spending priorities based on data. Performance indicators shift the focus of budgeting from inputs (such as salaries and capital expenditure) to outputs and outcomes. Thus, defining performance indicators and setting their baseline and targeted values essentially translate expected results of programs/polices into a monitoring tool. A continuous routine process of performance data collection and analysis helps government to understand to what extent the planned objectives of current policies/measures are being implemented and to identify potential needs for adjusting their design. While there is no single agreed definition of performance budgeting, the definition has been evolving to take into account different levels of use of performance indicators in decisions of budget allocations and the OECD currently defines it as “the use of performance information to inform budget decisions whether as a direct input to budget allocation decisions or as contextual information and/or inputs to budget planning, as well as to instil greater transparency and accountability throughout the budget process, by providing information to the public on performance objectives and results”[[6]](#footnote-7). The OECD’s Recommendations on Budgetary Governance in particular advises government to routinely present performance information in a way which informs, and provides useful context for, the financial allocations in the budget report” noting that performance information should be (i) limited to a small number of relevant indicators for each policy program or area; (ii) clear and easily understood; (iii) allows for tracking of results against targets and for comparison with international and other benchmarks; (iv) makes clear the link with government-wide strategic objectives[[7]](#footnote-8).

**PEMPAL countries also pursue enhancing mechanisms of public participation in fiscal policy and budget process.** Increased public participation shifts in resource allocations and improvements in public service delivery (especially in social sectors)[[8]](#footnote-9). The Global Initiative for Fiscal Transparency (GIFT) notes that public participation mechanisms increase contestability of fiscal policy design and implementation; reduce the influence of the political elite; and facilitate more effective accountability[[9]](#footnote-10). Public participation refers to the variety of ways in which the public (includes citizens, civil society organizations (CSOs), academics and other non-state actors) interacts directly with public authorities on policy design and implementation. Participation may be through face-to-face communication, deliberation or input to decision-making, or by written forms of communication including the Internet[[10]](#footnote-11). GIFT stresses that public participation’s main objective is to benefit the people and improve effectiveness of use of public resources, as it seeks feedback for improvements and includes relevant and diverse stakeholders[[11]](#footnote-12). International Budget Partnership’s Open Budget Index also increasingly takes into account public participation when ranking countries’ openness. Drawing on GIFT Principles on Participation in Public Finance, Open Budget Survey has been recently revised to impose higher standards on public participation[[12]](#footnote-13). In addition, the IFM Fiscal Transparency Code revision of 2014 included the principle of public participation, the - Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) Framework has also been revised in 2016 to include public participation component, and the OECD Toolkit on Budget Transparency presented in 2017 also devotes a significant section to this matter

**Meeting Objectives and Format**

**The key objectives of the meeting** are to:

* Provide the opportunity for BCOP member countries ***to review approaches and trends in intergovernmental fiscal relations*,** familiarize with developments in OECD countriesand discuss possible approaches and options for PEMPAL countries
* Provide the opportunity for broad BCOP membership to review practices and approaches on the issues of BCOP Working Groups focus in the past year - ***use of performance indicators in performance budgeting*** and ***public participation*.** Get feedback from BCOP members on the BCOP Working Groups’ most recent work on knowledge products:
	1. Performance Indicators in PEMPAL Countries: Trends and Challenges (by BCOP Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group)
	2. Public Participation in Fiscal Policy and the Budget Process – How to establish and/or strengthen mechanisms in PEMPAL countries (by BCOP Budget Transparency and Literacy Working Group).
* Update members on BCOP progress since the last plenary meeting and to report back on countries’ priorities gathered in the pre-meeting survey to inform the development of the BCOP Action Plan 2018-19.

**The format will comprise 2.5 days** commencing Day 0 with meetings of the BCOP Executive Committee and BCOP Resource Team, as illustrated in the table below and in more detail in the agenda (see ***Attachment 1)***.

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Overview** | **DAY 0, March 13** | **DAY 1, March 14** | **DAY 2, March 15** | **DAY 3 March 16** |
| **Morning Agenda Topics** | Arrivals BCOP Executive Committee and Resource Team | Meeting of the BCOP Executive CommitteeArrivals | **Use of performance indicators in performance budgeting** (Program and Performance Budgeting WG Day) | **Public participation** (Budget Literacy and Transparency WG Day) |
| **Afternoon Agenda Topics** | Meeting of the ResourceTeam | **Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations** | **Discussion Groups**  | **Discussion Groups**  |

**The two BCOP Working Groups will host parts of the agenda to share their recent work on these topics and discuss planned future work with boarder membership**. Similar format was tested in last plenary meeting for the first time and it received support from BCOP members. This approach to the annual plenary agenda also reflects the maturity of the network, whereby a significant proportion of BCOP’s work is now undertaken by Working Groups.

On Day 1, after a brief overview of PEMPAL and BCOP progress over the past year, presentations will be provided by the World Bank, PEFA Secretariat, and the OECD, while Austria will be examined as the international country case study:

* **World Bank will provide an introductory presentation on key concepts and issues and challenges in PEMPAL countries to set the scene for discussion on intergovernmental fiscal relations**. Overview of the key concepts and main issues to take into account when it comes to intergovernmental fiscal relations will be provided.[[13]](#footnote-14). In addition, the results of the mini pre-event survey of PEMPAL countries on their main challenges related to intergovernmental fiscal relations will be presented, to frame the discussions of the rest of this day.
* **PEFA Secretariat will give a presentation on coverage of subnational government and intergovernmental fiscal relations in PEFA Framework to explain what indicators are assessed and how they are assessed**. i.e. what standards are used for assessment. PEFA is used by governments as a snapshot of their performance in public finance management and it offers a common basis for examining PFM performance across national and subnational governments[[14]](#footnote-15). Specifically, subnational governments with a direct relationship to central government are assesses within PEFA indicators on transfers to subnational government and fiscal risk reporting.
* **OECD will provide a presentation on fiscal decentralization in OECD countries.** OECD’s Fiscal Federalism Network has recently completed two important studies, one on Fiscal Federalism 2016: Making Decentralization Work and on Institutions of Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations: Challenges Ahead from 2015.
* **Austrian Ministry of Finance** will present the specific country case on arrangements, practices, and lessons learnt related to intergovernmental fiscal relations in Austria. It is of notable interest to PEMPAL countries for Austria to share their experiences, given that it is one of the countries which is considered to have well developed intergovernmental coordination mechanism, as identified in above-mentioned OECD’s study on institutions of intergovernmental fiscal relations.

Given that this will be the first time BCOP discusses the topic of intergovernmental fiscal relations, it was decided that this half-day plenary introduction of this topic is best facilitated by presentations from international organizations and an OECD country case. Based on outcomes of these discussions during the plenary meeting, BCOP will consider potential continued work on this topic.

**On Day 2 an overview of recent progress of the Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group will be presented with a focus of the recently undertaken review of performance indicators.** In addition, best practices and lessons learnt from OECD countries in performance budgeting will be presented. Specifically, the agenda will comprise the following presentations:

* **Information on progress and plans of the Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group will serve as an introduction to Day 2** and will be delivered by the Working Group Chair, Mr. Nikolay Begchin from the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation.
* **Working Group’s draft knowledge product *Performance Indicators in PEMPAL Countries: Trends and Challenges* will be presented.** This will serve to identify common trends and challenges of the PEMPAL countries and shape the discussions about the focus of work of this Working Group in the next period, as well as the discussions on this topics in the rest of Day 2.
* **OECD will provide a presentation on the new OECD Best Practices for Performance Budgeting.** This document has been prepared by the OECD’s Working Party of Senior Budget Officials. It consists of seven best practices, each with 3-6 more specific recommendations and a narrative discussion, including a brief explanation of the evidence supporting their adoption and practical examples from OECD countries. A special focus will be given to discussion on best practices related specifically to performance indicators. The document is being finalized and comments from PEMPAL BCOP members will be useful for OECD counterparts.
* **Two country cases on performance indicators will be presented, both from PEMPAL region.** Serbia and Russia will present, as two of countries that participated in the review of performance indicators where indicators were well defined and lessons accumulated that can be shared with their peers from PEMPAL countries. This session will focus on PEMPAL country cases, since back-to-back with this plenary meeting, the Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group is planning to hold a separate one-day workshop on March 13 to discussthe performance budgeting in Austria with the Austrian Ministry of Finance. Austria has undergone through performance budgeting reforms and have presented to BCOP on their experiences in 2013. Thus, this would an opportunity for BCOP countries to get an update on Austrian performance budgeting reforms and to learn lessons related to the use of performance indicators in the budget decision making. Draft OECD Best Practice for Performance Budgeting highlight several aspects of Austrian experience. Some of the topics of interest of Working Group members include: roles of Ministry of Finance and line Ministries in setting and tracking performance indicators, actual usage of performance information in decision making and budget allocations, linkages between strategic planning and budgeting through performance information (including at highest government level), and connections with subnational government levels.

**Day 3 will review recent progress of Budget Literacy and Transparency Working Group on review of global and PEMPAL countries progress in public participation**. Specifically, the agenda of Day 3 will include:

* **Information on progress and plans of the Budget Literacy and Transparency Working Group as an introduction to Day 3**.
* **Overview of the Working Group’s progress on the knowledge product *Public Participation in Fiscal Policy and the Budget Process: How to establish and/or strengthen mechanisms in PEMPAL countries* will be presented.** This will serve to clarify definitions of public participation and its benefits, to identify best practices globally and regionally, and to shape the discussions about the focus of work of this Working Group in the next period.
* **IBP will provide a presentation on newest results of the Open Budget Survey, with focus on public participation.** IBP has recently strengthened its coverage of public participation in Open Budget Survey and will in this presentation give an overview of the findings of the first such expanded Survey, from 2017. More specifically, the Survey now includes 18 questions related to public participation, drawn from GIFT Principles, with a goal of capturing formal participation mechanisms at the national level. The Survey gives higher scores to countries which facilitate an engagement between governments and citizens, it assesses who is participating, what the purpose, scope, intended outcomes, and timeline is, and captures whether there was a summary/report/ feedback on the inputs received. Based on 2017 Survey findings, this presentation will indicate recommendations for PEMPAL countries on steps needed to improve their public participation mechanisms.
* **GIFT will also present on takeaways and insights on the OBS 2017 results on public participation.** The presentation will focus on new cases recently identified on the Guide on Public Participation.
* **Two country cases on public participation will be presented, both from PEMPAL region.** Georgia and Croatia will present, as two of countries where some of the best practices were identified by IBP and/or GIFT, including a budget monitoring analytical web forum established by Georgian State Audit Institution and the Croatian Commission on Fiscal Policy consisting of various members including external experts and CSOs.

**Both Day 2 and Day 3 will include afternoon discussion groups**, when the participants will discuss specific questions in small groups and report back findings of these discussions to the plenary meeting.

**Meeting Preparations**

**A pre-meeting survey will be distributed to collect the following data:**

1. **Inputs for BCOP 2018-2019 Action Plan.** The electronic survey will also include questions on country level priorities to assist with the development of the BCOP Action plan. This is the second year in which BCOP will collect this input in pre-plenary meeting survey, to have a formal recording of priorities. The prioritization and final plan will be presented by the BCOP Executive Committee during the meeting, as done in previous years.
2. **Inputs on questions for the small groups discussions**. The discussions will take place in the afternoon of Day 2 and Day 3, the first focusing on use of performance indicators in budgeting and the second - on citizens’ participation in budgeting. Discussion questions will be circulated by email a few days before the meeting and will be based on member feedback gained from this pre-meeting survey.
3. **Countries’ approaches and challenges related to Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations.** This will serve as a mini-overview of BCOP countries’ practices, which will be presented by the World Bank on Day 1 of the event, to set the scene for discussion.

**Participants**

**It is envisaged that this event will bring together up to 80 participants** including BCOP members and external experts. Experts from international organizations (e.g. World Bank, OECD, PEFA Secretariat, IBP, and GIFT) will also participate given their key role in providing advice, research and support to countries in public financial management reforms.

**Partners**

**The BCOP plenary meeting is being organized by the World Bank resource team and PEMPAL Secretariat in collaboration with a number of key partners**, including Ministry of Finance of Austria, the Ministry of Finance of the Russian Federation, and SECO.

**Contacts**

**BCOP Resource Team members:** Maya Gusarova (mgusarova@worldbank.org), Naida Čaršimamović Vukotić naidacar@gmail.com), Iryna Shcherbyna (ishcherbyna@worldbank.org)

**PEMPAL Secretariat:** Ms. Ksenia Galantsova (kgalantsova@worldbank.org)

**Attachment**  - Concept Note and Agenda of plenary meeting

**Background documents**

**Available at www.pempal.org – link to be been provided to all meeting participants via email**:

1. Plenary meeting presentations in network languages – English, Russian and BCS
2. Listing of links to all by BCOP resources - English, Russian and BCS
3. DRAFT BCOP Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group knowledge product Performance Indicators in PEMPAL Countries: Trends and Challenges – English version of the formal product in Word format and English, Russian and BCS of the 50-slide set of the main information. *NOTE: participants will be invited to provide their comments to draft product based on summary presentation that will be given during the meeting and the 50-slide set of the main information circulated as additional background material. Based on comments received during and after the plenary meeting, the PPBWG will finalize the formal product.*
4. Draft OECD Best Practices for Performance Budgeting – English version (to be translated to Russian and BCS after the finalization by OECD)
5. BCOP Budget Transparency and Literacy Working Group background paper prepared to facilitate work on the knowledge product Public Participation *in Fiscal Policy and the Budget Process – How to establish and/or strengthen mechanisms in PEMPAL countries*

For information on PEMPAL please visit [www.pempal.org](http://www.pempal.org). All materials for this event will be posted at <https://www.pempal.org/events/bcop-plenary-meeting>.

***Important Note****: In accordance with the PEMPAL Executive’s decision to ‘go green’ to achieve efficiencies in PEMPAL events, the only documents that will be distributed at the meeting will be the agenda and information letter. Thus, all participants are requested to print out their own documents and bring them to the meeting. Thank you for your understanding and cooperation.*

**ATTACHMENT**

**AGENDA**

**PEMPAL PLENARY MEETING OF BCOP**

**Improving Effectiveness and Accountability of Public Expenditures:**

**Trends in Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations, Performance Budgeting and Budget Participation**

**MARCH 14-16, 2018**

**VIENNA, AUSTRIA**

**Objectives**

**The key objectives of the meeting** are to:

* Provide the opportunity for BCOP member countries ***to review approaches and trends in intergovernmental fiscal relations*,** familiarize with developments in OECD countriesand discuss possible approaches and options for PEMPAL countries
* Provide the opportunity for broad BCOP membership to review practices and approaches on the issues of BCOP Working Groups’ focus in the past year - ***use of performance indicators in performance budgeting*** and ***public participation*.** Get feedback from BCOP members on the BCOP Working Groups’ most recent work on knowledge products:
	1. Performance Indicators in PEMPAL Countries: Trends and Challenges (by BCOP Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group)
	2. Public Participation in Fiscal Policy and the Budget Process – How to establish and/or strengthen mechanisms in PEMPAL countries (by BCOP Budget Transparency and Literacy Working Group).
* Update members on BCOP progress since the last plenary meeting and to report back on countries’ priorities gathered in the pre-meeting survey to inform the development of the BCOP Action Plan 2018-19.

**Day Zero, Tuesday, March 13 – Executive Committee**

Arrivals BCOP Executive Committee and Resource Team

12.30-14.00 **Lunch in Hotel**

18.00 **Meeting of technical** **Resource Team**

19.00 **Dinner for BCOP Executive Committee with guests from the Ministry of Finance of Austria**

 **March 14, Wednesday**

10.30 **Meeting of** **BCOP Executive Committee**

**Day One - Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations**

Moderators: Alija Aljovic (BCOP Executive Committee, Assistant minister for Budget, Federal Ministry of Finance in Bosnia and Herzegovina), Maya Gusarova (Lead Coordinator of BCOP Resource Team, Senior Public Sector Specialist, World Bank)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Time | Activity |
|  | **Arrivals BCOP members** |
| 12.00-13.00 | **Lunch**  |
| 13.00-13.30 | **Registrations** |
| 13.30-14.00 | **Welcome** and opening:* [Linda Van Gelder](http://isearch.worldbank.org/skillfinder/ppl_profile_new/000022550), Country Director, Europe Western Balkans, Work Bank
* Dan Boyce, Chair of PEMPAL Steering Committee and Practice Manager, Governance – ECA East, World Bank
* Anna Belenchuk, BCOP Chair, Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation
* Table introductions (10-15 minutes) including introductions of any newcomers
 |
| 14.00-14.15 | **Presentation 1: BCOP Executive Committee - Update on BCOP activities including development of BCOP Action Plan 2018-19** Kanat Asangulov, BCOP Executive Committee, Head of Budget Policy Department, Kyrgyz Republic, Ministry of Finance |
| 14.15-14.45 | **Presentation 2: World Bank - Overview of Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations and Results of the Pre-event Survey of PEMPAL Countries.** Iryna Shcherbyna, Public Sector Specialist, World Bank |
| 14.45-15.15 | **Presentation 3: PEFA Secretariat –Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations in Public Expenditure and Financial Accountability (PEFA) Framework,** Jens Kromann Kristensen, Acting Head of PEFA Secretariat |
| 15.15-15.45 | Group Photo and Coffee Break |
| 15.45-16.15 | **Presentation 4: OECD – Fiscal Decentralization in OECD Countries,** Sean Dougherty, Fiscal Decentralization Network, Public Expenditure Division, Public Governance Directorate, OECD |
| 16.15-16.45 | **Presentation 5: International Country Case study – Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations in Austria -** Gerlinde Zimmer, 2nd Deputy Head, Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations Department, Philipp Päcklar, Advisor, Intergovernmental Fiscal Relations Department, Ministry of Finance of Austria |
| 16.45-17.45 | **Questions to the Panel of speakers**  |
| 19.30- | Welcome Dinner in hotel  |

**Day Two – Thursday, March 15 – Use of Performance Indicators in Budgeting - Hosted by the BCOP Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group**

Moderators: Nicolay Begchin (BCOP Executive Committee, Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation), Naida Čaršimamović Vukotić (Public Finance Management Consultant, BCOP Resource Team, World Bank).

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Time | Activity |
| 8.30-9.00 | **Introduction to Day’s Agenda** **Presentation 6: PPBWG - Update on Progress of the Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group and Future Plans,** Nicolay Begchin, BCOP Executive Committee, Deputy Director, Department of Budget Methodology and Financial Reporting. Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation |
| 9.00-9.30 | **Presentation 7: PPBWG - Presentation on Program and Performance Budgeting Working Group’s Draft Knowledge Product on Performance Indicators in PEMPAL Countries: Trends and Challenges** –Naida Čaršimamović Vukotić, Public Finance Management Consultant, BCOP Resource Team, World Bank |
| 9.30-10.00 | **Presentation 8: OECD - OECD Best Practices for Performance Budgeting,** Ivor Beazley, Senior Policy Analyst, Public Governance and Territorial Development Directorate, Budgeting and Public Expenditures Division, OECD |
| 10.00-10.30 | **Questions to the panel of speakers** |
| 10.30-11.00 |  Coffee Break |
| 11.00-12.30 | **Presentations 9 and 10: PEMPAL Country Case Studies:** **Performance indicators in Russia -** Nicolay Begchin, Deputy Director, Department of Budget Methodology and Financial Reporting. Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation**Performance indicators in Serbia –** Mirjana Cojbasic, State Secretary, Budget Department, Ministry of Finance of Serbia |
| 12.30-13.00 | **Questions to the panel of speakers** |
| 13.00-14.30 | Lunch at Hotel |
| 14.30-16.30 | **Reform Issues and Challenges discussion** (parallel discussions on topics as proposed by the participants, in language-based groups where possible) * **Two questions to be addressed**: Participants will break into language-based groups to discuss 2 questions (to be circulated by email a few days before the meeting based on member feedback from pre-meeting survey). A scribe and presenter should be appointed at the beginning of the discussions.

**Coffee served from 15.30 (in or near discussion rooms)** |
| 16.30-17.00 | **PEMPAL member group presentations** from Groups 1, 2, and 3 (5-8 minutes each) |
| 19.00 | Dinner in the hotel  |

**Day Three – Friday, March 16 – Public Participation - Hosted by the BCOP Budget Literacy and Transparency Working Group**

Moderators: Anna Belenchuk (BCOP Chair, Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation), Maya Gusarova (Lead Coordinator of BCOP Resource Team, Senior Public Sector Specialist, World Bank)

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| Time | Activity |
| 8.30-9.00 | **Presentation 11: BLTWG - Introduction to Day’s Agenda and overview of Working Group on Budget Literacy and Transparency** – Anna Belenchuk, BCOP Executive Committee, Head of Unit of Budget Analysis and Development, Department of Budget Methodology and Financial Reporting, Ministry of Finance, Russian Federation |
| 9.00-9.30 | **Presentation 12: BLTWG - Presentation on Budget Literacy and Transparency Working Group’s progress towards the Knowledge Product on Public Participation in Fiscal Policy and the Budget Process**: **How to Establish and/or Strengthen Mechanisms in PEMPAL countries** – Harika Masud, Social Development Specialist, World Bank |
| 9.30-10.00 | **Presentation 13: IBP - Public Participation Results of Open Budget Survey, International Budget Partnership** – Sally Torbert, Program Officer, IBP |
| 10.00-10.30 | **Questions to the panel of speakers** |
| 10.30-11.00 |  Coffee Break |
| 11.00-11.20 | **Presentation 14: GIFT - GIFT Takeaways and Insights on the OBS 2017 Results on Public Participation, and New Cases Recently Identified in the Guide on Public Participation** - Juan Pablo Guerrero, GIFT Network Director |
| 11.20-12.30 | **Presentations 15 and 16: PEMPAL Country Case Studies:****Public participation Mechanisms in Georgia -** Inga Gurgenidze, Head of the State and Consolidated Budget Formation Division, Budget Department, Ministry of Finance of Georgia**Public participation Mechanisms in Croatia** - Mladenka Karacic, Head of Sector, State Treasury Department, Ministry of Finance of Croatia |
| 12.30-13.00 | **Questions to the panel of speakers** |
| 13.00-14.30 | Lunch at Hotel |
| 14.30-16.30 | **Reform Issues and Challenges discussion** (parallel discussions on topics as proposed by the participants, in language-based groups where possible) * **Two questions to be addressed**: Participants will break into language-based groups to discuss 2 questions (to be circulated by email a few days before the meeting based on member feedback from pre-meeting survey). A scribe and presenter should be appointed at the beginning of the discussions.

**Coffee served from 15**.**30 (in or near discussion rooms)** |
| 16.30-17.00 | **PEMPAL member group presentations** from Groups 1, 2, and 3 (5-8 minutes each) |
| 17.00-18.00 | **Community Building.** Moderated and led by the BCOP Executive Committee. **- Learnings related to content of meeting**: Tables to be given 10 minutes to provide their learnings and to give feedback on how we can improve PEMPAL BCOP meetings**- Social report on meeting and certificate/picture distribution**, PEMPAL Secretariat |
| 19.00 | Dinner in the hotel  |

**Saturday March 17 Departures**

1. Source: PEMPAL Strategy 2017-22, <http://www.pempal.org/strategy>. [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
2. Comprising 10 members from Ministries of Finance from 9 member countries: Armenia, Albania, Belarus, Bosnia and Herzegovina, Bulgaria, Croatia, Kyrgyz Republic, Russian Federation, and Turkey. [↑](#footnote-ref-3)
3. IMF and Routledge Studies in European Economy, 2014, Designing a European Fiscal Union: Lessons from the Experience of Fiscal Federations, available at <https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Luc_Eyraud/publication/268197140_Constraints_on_Subnational_Fiscal_Policy_Chapter_3_in_Designing_a_European_Fiscal_Union_Routledge_ed/links/546371170cf2837efdb3096e/Constraints-on-Subnational-Fiscal-Policy-Chapter-3-in-Designing-a-European-Fiscal-Union-Routledge-ed.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-4)
4. For example, OECD, 2016, Fiscal Federalism 2016: Making Decentralization Work, available at <http://www.oecd.org/publications/fiscal-federalism-2016-9789264254053-en.htm>. [↑](#footnote-ref-5)
5. IMF and Routledge Studies in European Economy, 2014, Designing a European Fiscal Union: Lessons from the Experience of Fiscal Federations, available at <https://www.researchgate.net/profile/Luc_Eyraud/publication/268197140_Constraints_on_Subnational_Fiscal_Policy_Chapter_3_in_Designing_a_European_Fiscal_Union_Routledge_ed/links/546371170cf2837efdb3096e/Constraints-on-Subnational-Fiscal-Policy-Chapter-3-in-Designing-a-European-Fiscal-Union-Routledge-ed.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-6)
6. OECD, Public Governance Committee Working Party of Senior Budget Officials, 2017, Draft OECD Best Practices for Performance Budgeting. [↑](#footnote-ref-7)
7. OECD, Public Governance and Territorial Development Directorate, Recommendations of the Council on Budgetary Governance, 2015, available at <https://www.oecd.org/gov/budgeting/Recommendation-of-the-Council-on-Budgetary-Governance.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-8)
8. GIFT and IBP, 2015,The Impacts of Fiscal Openness: a Review of the Evidence, by de Renzio and Wehner, March available at <http://www.internationalbudget.org/wp-content/uploads/impacts-of-fiscal-openness-gift-ibp-2015.pdf> [↑](#footnote-ref-9)
9. GIFT, 2017, What is public participation in fiscal policy and why is it important? Posted in Public Participation in Fiscal Policies, by Murray Petrie, June 7, <http://www.fiscaltransparency.net/use/what-is-public-participation-in-fiscal-policy-and-why-is-it-important/> [↑](#footnote-ref-10)
10. GIFT, 2016, How are the GIFT Principles on Public Participation in Fiscal Policy being incorporated in international fiscal openness instruments by Murray Petrie, December 15, 2016 available at <http://www.fiscaltransparency.net/blog_open_public.php?IdToOpen=4570> [↑](#footnote-ref-11)
11. Guerrero, Juan Pablo, GIFT, 2017, presentation on Public Participation in Fiscal Policies: Standards, Tools, and International Experience. [↑](#footnote-ref-12)
12. Garg, Anjali and Hasan, Suad, International Budget Partnership, 2017, presentation on Open Budget Survey Findings on Public Participation. [↑](#footnote-ref-13)
13. For example, as given in World Bank, Public Sector Governance and Accountability Series, 2008, Intergovernmental Fiscal Transfers: Principles and Practice, available at <http://siteresources.worldbank.org/PSGLP/Resources/IntergovernmentalFiscalTransfers.pdf> and in <http://www1.worldbank.org/publicsector/decentralization/fiscal.htm>. [↑](#footnote-ref-14)
14. PEFA Framework for Assessing Public Financial Management, 2016, available at <https://pefa.org/sites/default/files/PEFA%20Framework_English.pdf>. [↑](#footnote-ref-15)