Minutes of the B COP Executive Committee meeting in Tallinn, Estonia; June 30, 2012

1. Present

Luiza Shehu and Gelardina Prodani (Albania); Konstantin Krityan and Hayser Gaspayan (Armenia); Svetlana Radovanović and Stevan Brkić (Bosnia and Herzegovina); Elena Zyunina (Russia); Klas Klaas (OECD Sigma); Maya Gusarova, Deanna Aubrey and Naida Čaršimamović Vukotić (World Bank – Resource Team); Tatjana Suurkask and Dragica Todorović (Interpreters); Polona Sirnik and Senka Maver (PEM PAL Secretariat, CEF).

On behalf of Alena Slishevskaya, Chair of the B COP, the meeting was chaired by Deanna Aubrey, PFM Advisor.

2. Discussion on key recommendations for B COP in PEM PAL Evaluation (Mokoro, 2012)

2.1. Background

B COP Executive Committee discussed three elements important for B COP activities: (i) leadership and management, (ii) knowledge products, and (iii) quality of membership. The Evaluation also considered them important for the B COP. Overall, the participants noted that due to specificities of the budget preparation process (which is more intense throughout the year in comparison to other functions of Ministries of Finance and Internal Audit Institutions) and the specificities of the budget preparation materials (which are less prescribed in terms of international best practices and broader than documentation/manuals for treasury and internal audit), B COP is not easily comparable to other two Communities of Practice (Internal Audit and Treasury).

2.2. Discussion

Leadership and management. The B COP has had a less stable leadership and membership than the other two COPs. In a year, two B COP Chairs left; A. Slizhevskaya resigned from the MoF of Belarus effective June 30, 2012. Also, budget preparation deadlines are usually very tight, and leave the budget people little time for engagement in PEM PAL. For this reason, the B COP Executive Committee should held quarterly rather than monthly meetings. Careful consideration should also be given to the future composition of the B COP Executive Committee and election of its Chair. Also the resource team proposed members to consider assigning specific functional / or thematic roles and responsibilities to Executive Committee members, as a way to provide support to the Chair.

Knowledge products. Evaluation recommendations emphasized the need for the overall network, including B COP, to turn the implicit knowledge capital into explicit knowledge products that are available for members. Resource team proposed various concrete options to explore as a part of B COP agenda: (i) cooperating with OECD SIGMA on budget and practices survey (expanding the current survey to include all PEM PAL countries); (ii) undertaking analytical study and compiling knowledge product on fiscal rules in the EU and PEM PAL countries; and, (iii) cooperating with the World Bank team in undertaking an overview of PFM reforms in the PEM PAL countries. Creation of sub-working groups to discuss specific B COP related topics was also suggested.

In order to avoid duplication and overlapping, some speakers stressed that knowledge products ought to be directly linked to topics discussed at B COP meetings, and be subject to subsequent reviews. To make the discussions at these meetings efficient, they should address practical issues and result in concrete recommendations. Also presentations should be more focused in terms of topics rather than more general overviews given in previous plenary meetings. Thus, it was decided that the Executive Committee will decide on detailed agenda and needed related knowledge products (which will subsequently be prepared by the resource team) for the February 2013 Plenary meeting in their next meeting in September 2012 in Paris.
At future SBO/OECD meetings the PEM PAL countries should also participate with presentations.

**Quality of membership.** The discussion focused on improvement of membership sustainability in B COP. The participants emphasized the importance of Executive Committee personal members’ commitment to participation in implementation of B COP action plan and overall PEMPAL program activities, as well as agreed to undertake careful analysis of the current membership in B COP. The resource team offered to prepare (i) Rules of procedure for the Executive Committee; and (ii) analysis of membership, based on the participation at the B COP events.

### 2.3. Conclusions

- (i) The resource team will analyze membership quality (level of participation);
- (ii) The resource team will define Rules of procedure for the Executive Committee;
- (iii) The resource team will prepare initial draft Agenda and proposals for knowledge products for the February 2013 Plenary meeting to be discussed and subject of decision of the Executive Committee in their September 2012 meeting in Paris.
- (iv) The Secretariat will facilitate a presentation of Wiki possibilities to the Executive Committee in Paris. The Executive Committee will then decide whether this facility will be used by the BCoP and in which way (an Executive Committee member may be selected to manage this, should the Executive Committee decide so).
- (v) PEM PAL countries will be included in the next OECD Budget Survey. B CoP members will be informed about the procedure. Preliminary results will be presented in the February 2013 Plenary meeting, if available by then.
- (vi) PEM PAL countries will participate in the next SBO/OECD meeting and propose including their presentations into the agenda of the meeting.
- (vii) The B COP Executive Committee will meet in quarterly meetings.
- (viii) Interest of Belarus and Croatia to continue participation in the Executive Committee will be checked;
- (ix) In connection with the election of the Chair of the B COP Executive Committee, the Secretariat will circulate CV format to be filled out by the members of the B COP Executive Committee, and returned to the Secretariat. (See Attachment for instructions and proposal for the nomination/election procedure).

### 3. Roles and responsibilities

**Discussion.** The PFM Advisor explained the roles of the resource team and the Secretariat in helping the B COP Executive Committee perform its leadership function (draft agendas, organize meetings, etc.). The wiki, which has already been set up, could be used to facilitate the exchange of information; a live training session on its functionality could be organized during the Paris meeting. OECD Sigma representative explained their role of being an active part of the resource team, happy to provide country products and promote the network.


**4.1. Background**

The following B COP activities and budgets have been confirmed by the Steering Committee for the period from July 2012 until June 2013 (amounts in 000 USD).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>#</th>
<th>Nature</th>
<th>Location &amp; Time</th>
<th>Objectives</th>
<th>Indicative budget</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Plenary</td>
<td>Feb13/Mntg(Fra)</td>
<td>Perform information &amp; decision making</td>
<td>180</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Small group meeting</td>
<td>Sep12/Georg(Cro)</td>
<td>IT solutions for budget reforms</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Small group meeting</td>
<td>TBC</td>
<td>Per unit financial health &amp; education</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Small group meeting</td>
<td>TBC</td>
<td>ExCom meeting</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Study visit</td>
<td>TBC</td>
<td></td>
<td>30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>6</td>
<td>Other</td>
<td>TBC</td>
<td>Members attend other COP events</td>
<td>17.5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td><strong>393</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
4.2. Discussion
Implications for the B COP work of the Budget Management Guidelines, which were recently approved by the Steering Committee, were discussed. Also discussed was timing of various B COP meetings, and rules that apply for the study visits (defined by the Guidelines for study visits; http://www.pempal.org/rules/).
One representative felt that Performance Budgeting has already been discussed at the Bohinj meeting, and insisted that Medium Term Budgetary Framework be part of the next B COP Plenary meeting.

4.3. Conclusions
(i) **The IT solutions for budget reforms**, initially planned for the fall 2012, will be moved to April 2013. The Secretariat will check with Georgia and Croatia whether they are still interested in hosting this event, and request a short info on their recent reforms in this area.

(ii) **The per unit financing in health and education** meeting will also be moved to April 2013.

(iii) **Next B COP Plenary.** By September, the members of the Executive Committee will think about other topics to be discussed in the B COP Plenary, now planned for early 2013, and the initial discussion on the agenda will take place at the next Executive Committee meeting. Medium Term Budgetary Framework will be considered to be included into the agenda of the next Plenary.

5. **Update on improvement initiatives (virtual library, success stories, website) and other activities**
The Secretariat representatives provided an overview of the recent initiatives undertaken by the Secretariat, and the PFM Advisor briefed the Executive Committee on the status of the PEM PAL Strategy 2012 - 2017.
ATTACHMENT

Dear members of the B COP Executive Committee,

Please use the following form to submit your CV to the Secretariat (bojana.crnadak@cef-see.org), by August 10, 2012.

CURRICULUM VITAE

First and last name
Address

EDUCATIONAL BACKGROUND

From .... to......... ________________________________
From......... to .......... ________________________________

PROFESSIONAL EXPERIENCE

From .... to......... ________________________________
From......... to .......... ________________________________

TRAINING / CERTIFICATION


INTERESTED IN THE FOLLOWING B COP ROLE/TOPIC/ACTIVITY:
+ Knowledge products
  + Communication with the membership
  + Member
  + Chair
  + Other ________________________________

Also, please mark whether you agree with the following Rules for the nomination/election of the Chair of the B COP Executive Committee.

YES / NO

1. One vote per country.
2. Only members of the B COP Executive Committee are allowed to vote.
3. Self nominations are allowed and encouraged.
4. Voting procedure is secret.
5. A two-stage election process applies: nominations and elections.
6. Nominations for the Chair position are collected by the Secretariat in a secret vote (nobody knows who nominates who).
7. Nomination procedure: On August 10, the Secretariat circulates CVs received by then from the members of the B COP Executive Committee. By end August, the nominations will be collected by the Secretariat via e-mail.
8. The two top ranked candidates will take part in election of the Chair of the B COP Executive Committee.
9. Elections will take place on-line (through survey monkey).
10. Elections will take place at the Paris Cross COP meeting.
11. A B COP Executive Committee meeting will be held after the election at which the results will be announced.